United States History
Section II
Total Time – 1 hour, 30 minutes

Question 1 (Document-Based Question)

Suggested reading period: 15 minutes

Suggested writing period: 40 minutes

This question is based on the accompanying documents. The documents have been edited for the purpose of this exercise.

In your response you should do the following:

- **Thesis**: Present a thesis that makes a historically defensible claim and responds to all parts of the question. The thesis must consist of one or more sentences located in one place, either in the introduction or in the conclusion.
- **Argument Development**: Develop and support a cohesive argument that recognizes and accounts for historical complexity by explicitly illustrating relationships among historical evidence such as contradiction, corroboration, and/or qualification.
- **Use of Documents**: Utilize the content of at least six documents to support the stated thesis or a relevant argument.
- **Sourcing the Documents**: Explain the significance of the author’s point of view, author’s purpose, historical context, and/or audience for at least four documents.
- **Contextualization**: Situate the argument by explaining the broader historical events, developments, or processes immediately relevant to the question.
- **Outside Evidence**: Provide an example or additional piece of specific evidence beyond those found in the documents to support or qualify the argument.
- **Synthesis**: Extend the argument by explaining the connections between the argument and one of the following
  - A development in a different historical period, situation, era, or geographical area.
  - A course theme and/or approach to history that is not the focus of the essay (such as political, economic, social, cultural, or intellectual history).

1. Explain how President Carter’s actions taken to resolve the Hostage Crisis in Iran may or may not have been a proportionate response. What factors guided the decisions he made?
Background Information

The summary below is for background information. Analysis of it is not required and will not count toward the required documents.

On November 4, 1979, Iranian militants stormed the United States Embassy in Tehran and took approximately seventy Americans captive. This terrorist act triggered the most profound crisis of the Carter presidency and began a personal ordeal for Jimmy Carter and the American people that lasted 444 days.

President Carter committed himself to the safe return of the hostages while protecting America’s interests and prestige. He pursued a policy of restraint that put a higher value on the lives of the hostages than on American retaliatory power. A spectrum of responses were deployed, including direct appeals, economic sanctions, and a military rescue mission. The toll of patient diplomacy was great, but President Carter’s actions eventually brought freedom for the hostages.

Mohammed Reza Pahlavi, Shah of Iran, began his reign in 1941, succeeding his father, Reza Khan, to the throne. In a 1953 power struggle with his prime minister, the Shah gained American support to prevent nationalization of Iran’s oil industry. In return for assuring the U.S. a steady supply of oil, the Shah received economic and military aid from eight American presidents.

Early in the 1960s, the Shah announced social and economic reforms but refused to grant broad political freedom. Iranian nationalists condemned his U.S. supported regime and his “westernizing” of Iran. During rioting in 1963, the Shah cracked down, suppressing his opposition. Among those arrested and exiled was a popular religious nationalist and bitter foe of the United States, the Ayatollah Ruhollah Khomeini.

Between 1963 and 1979, the Shah spent billions of oil dollars on military weapons. The real price of military strength was the loss of popular support. Unable to sustain economic progress and unwilling to expand democratic freedoms, the Shah’s regime collapsed in revolution. On January 16, 1979, the Shah fled Iran, never to return.

The exiled Ayatollah Khomeini returned to Tehran in February 1979 and whipped popular discontent into rabid anti-Americanism. When the Shah came to America for cancer treatment in October, the Ayatollah incited Iranian militants to attack the U.S. On November 4, the American Embassy in Tehran was overrun and its employees taken captive. The hostage crisis had begun.
Source description: Situation in Iran from the Records of Interdepartmental and Intradepartmental Committees (State Department), November 4, 1979

Situation in Iran as of 0700 EST November 4, 1979

At about 0345 EST (Noon Tehran time) the American Embassy compound in Tehran was overrun by about 3000 demonstrators. The demonstrators inside the compound are unarmed, in their early twenties. They may be a mixture of students and members of the Islamic guerilla group Mujahedin Khalq. The demonstrators first penetrated the Chancery building through a basement window and then proceeded to occupy the ground floor of the Chancery. The demonstrators in the early stages of the incursion took hostage four Marine Security Guards and the Embassy Security Officer. Our Charge and Political Counselor happened to be at the Foreign Ministry at the time of the attack. They and the Embassy contacted the Prime Minister's Office and were promised that Iranian security forces would be sent to the rescue. No help came, and the Embassy after an hour's siege, including attempts to set the building on fire and the use of a torch to try to cut through the upstairs steel doors, found it necessary to let the demonstrators in on the upper floor.

At that time there were about 80 Embassy employees, American and Iranian in the Chancery. Another group of employees was under siege in the Consular Section, a separate building on the compound. When the demonstrators entered the second floor of the Chancery, the Embassy employees were led out. 11 Americans remained in the Communications vault but have subsequently surrendered. Current reports indicate that all of the hostages are being kept within the compound.

Charge Laingen is now in Foreign Minister Yazdi's office. Yazdi indicated they are attempting to despatch Ayatollah Beheshti to the compound to speak with the demonstrators. The Embassy compound is surrounded by unidentified security forces.

Two people from the Foreign Office have been sent to the compound to get in touch with the demonstrators.
At this time, there are no reports of any injuries to Amcits. The British Embassy in Tehran reports that a news bulletin has been issued indicating all Americans are safe. The bulletin also urged other students not to join the demonstration.

The occupying students have issued a statement demanding the extradition of the former Shah. The statement described the occupation as a protest against the conspiracies of imperialism and Zionism. The students called on other student groups not to try to enter the compound.

Harold H. Saunders
Assistant Secretary
Bureau of Near Eastern and South Asian Affairs

Robert S. Steven
Senior Watch Officer
Dear Ayatollah Khomeini:

Based on the willingness of the Revolutionary Council to receive them, I am asking two distinguished Americans, Mr. Ramsey Clark and Mr. William G. Miller, to carry this letter to you and to discuss with you and your designees the situation in Tehran and the full range of current issues between the U.S. and Iran.

In the name of the American people, I ask that you release unharmed all Americans presently detained in Iran and those held with them and allow them to leave your country safely and without delay. I ask you to recognize the compelling humanitarian reasons, firmly based in international law, for doing so.

I have asked both men to meet with you and to hear from you your perspective on events in Iran and the problems which have arisen between our two countries. The people of the United States desire to have relations with Iran based upon equality, mutual respect, and friendship.

They will report to me immediately upon their return.

Sincerely,

Jimmy Carter

His Excellency
Ayatollah Khomeini
Qom, Iran
Document 3


EXECUTIVE ORDER NO. 12170

Nov. 14, 1979, 44 F.R. 65729

BLOCKING IRANIAN GOVERNMENT PROPERTY

Pursuant to the authority vested in me as President by the Constitution and laws of the United States including the International Emergency Economic Powers Act, 50 U.S.C.A. sec. 1701 et seq. [this chapter], the National Emergencies Act, 50 U.S.C. sec. 1601 et seq. [section 1601 et seq. of this title], and 3 U.S.C. sec. 301 [section 301 of Title 3, The President].

I, JIMMY CARTER, President of the United States, find that the situation in Iran constitutes an unusual and extraordinary threat to the national security, foreign policy and economy of the United States and hereby declare a national emergency to deal with that threat.

I hereby order blocked all property and interests in property of the Government of Iran, its instrumentalities and controlled entities and the Central Bank of Iran which are or become subject to the jurisdiction of the United States or which are in or come within the possession or control of persons subject to the jurisdiction of the United States.

The Secretary of the Treasury is authorized to employ all powers granted to me by the International Emergency Economic Powers Act [this chapter] to carry out the provisions of this order.

This order is effective immediately and shall be transmitted to the Congress and published in the Federal Register.

JIMMY CARTER
Document 4

Source description: “President Jimmy Carter’s Annotated Statement on the Failed Rescue Mission Regarding the Hostages in Iran.” National Archives Catalog, April, 25, 1980

Announcement/Rescue Mission Termination 4/25/80

1. LATE YESTERDAY I CANCELLED A CAREFULLY PLANNED OPERATION
2. WHICH WAS UNDERWAY IN IRAN TO POSITION OUR TEAM
3. FOR A RESCUE OF THE AMERICAN HOSTAGES
4. WHO HAVE BEEN HELD CAPTIVE THERE SINCE NOVEMBER 4.
5. EQUIPMENT FAILURE IN THE RESCUE HELICOPTERS
6. MADE IT NECESSARY TO END THE MISSION.
7. AS OUR TEAM WAS WITHDRAWING,
8. TWO OF OUR AIRCRAFT COLLIDED ON THE GROUND
    IN A REMOTE DESERT LOCATION IN IRAN.
9. THERE WAS NO FIGHTING & NO COMBAT.
10. BUT TO MY DEEP REGRET, 8 OF THE CREWMEN ON THE 2 AIRCRAFT WERE KILLED,
11. AND SEVERAL OTHER AMERICANS WERE HURT IN THE ACCIDENT.
12. OUR PEOPLE WERE IMMEDIATELY AIRLIFTED OUT OF IRAN.
13. THOSE WHO WERE INJURED ARE GETTING MEDICAL TREATMENT,
14. AND ALL OF THEM ARE EXPECTED TO RECOVER.

No Detection by Iranian Authorities Until Several Hours After Withdrawing.
Document 5

Source description: Hostage Robert Ode’s diary entry on December 7, 1980

December 7, 1980 (400th Day!!!-also Sunday, Pearl Harbor Day)

Today is our 400th day in captivity. I wonder when our Gov’t is going to get off its dead ass and really do something to get us out of here? It should have come in here with force the day we were taken as hostages. Now it never will as it is too late. Certainly doesn’t seem to be any hope to get out of here before Christmas. No hot water today so took an ice cold shower and changed underwear—and it was cold! No mail again today. Got a fresh orange for supper.

This evening when I was taken to the toilet there was another hostage there whom I didn’t recognize. He identified himself as “Reagan” who I remember was in the “Mushroom Inn” and late in the Charge’s bedroom in the resident last year same time I was. He asked me who my roommates were and I only had time to give him Don Hohman’s name when the guard realized his mistake in letting me in the toilet with another hostage and came running back to get me out of there. These idiots are so deathly afraid of letting us be in contact with other hostages! They are really paranoid. Hohman told me it was “Sgt. Reagan” of “Armies Mag”. I remembered he was sick at the time were first captured, apparently with flu or something as they had to call a doctor for him and, I believe, took him out of the room—perhaps to a hospital.

Document 6

Source description: Excerpt from the Congressional Research Service’s report on the issue of whether or not to admit the Shah into the United States prepared for then-White House Counsel Lloyd Cutler

The issue of where the Shah would go into exile was one of concern for the United States as soon as he left Iran on Jan. 16, 1979, and was undoubtedly intensified after the fall of the Bakhtiar government and the decision to effect a reconciliation with the Bazargan government. There was evident conflict between U.S. obligations to the Shah in light of longstanding support for his regime and the efforts at reconciliation…

…On May 22, 1979, Henry Kissinger said that the U.S. owed a “debt of honor” to the Shah and should grant him political asylum…the Administration’s public position…was that the Shah was welcome “in principle” but that there were also questions of timing, security, and U.S. national interests…

The decision to admit the Shah raised serious policy questions. At least four factors in this decision can be identified: (1) the U.S. tradition of serving as a political haven; (2) the question of loyalty to a former ally and friend; (3) the new factor of the Shah’s apparently deteriorating health; and (4) the possible reactions in Iran and its effect on the reconciliation policy.
Document 7

Source description: Photograph of freed Americans held hostage for 444 days in Iran arriving in at Rhein-Main U.S. Air Force base in Frankfurt, West Germany from Algeria, January 21, 1981